MAINTENANCE OBLIGATION IN THE BRAZILIAN LAW SYSTEM

Preparing for the implementation of the 2007 Child Support Convention and its Protocol on the Law Applicable to Maintenance Obligations

















Brazilians abroad

• According to Ministry of External Relations:

- Foreign-born population:
 - About 3 million.



- Tourist population:
 - About 3,5 million annually.











Concept of Maintenance Obligation



 Maintenance is due to those who have not sufficient assets or have no means for provinding their maintenance by their own work e can be claimed to another person without embezzlement necessary for its sustenance (Civil Code, article 1695).













Recovery of Maintenance in the

European Union and Worldwide Heidelberg Conference 5 – 8 March 2013



Reciprocity Principle

- The right to maintenance is a reciprocal obligation between parents and children, and extended to all ascendants, descendants and second degree collateral relatives.
- (Civil Code, article 1696).

Recovery of Maintenance in the European Union and Worldwide Heidelberg Conference 5 – 8 March 2013

















Nature of Maintenance Obligation

Recovery of Maintenance in the European Union and Worldwide Heidelberg Conference 5 – 8 March 2013

The nature of maintenance is divided:

- Necessary or natural maintenance: comprises those for basic needs, the very survival of person, in accordance with articles 1694, § 2º and 1704 of Civil Code.
- Appropriate or civil maintenance: refers to the others necessities, for instance education and health benefits, as stated in Article 1694 of the Civil Code, that a person needs to live in a manner consistent with its standard of living.













Jurisprudence

Recovery of Maintenance in the European Union and Worldwide Heidelberg Conference 5 – 8 March 2013

The Superior Court of Justice has decided:

 Father and mother have a joint obligation: and each of them assumes an independent status in relation to maintenance obligation (REsp 964.866).



Duration of child support: The maintenance obligation is due to 18 years-old. However, courts have determined to pay up to 24 years old. (REsp 1.218.510). Reasons: necessity of adequate professional education (only undergraduate or technical studies) and also by proof of necessity.











Jurisprudence

- The Superior Court of Justice has decided:
- **Grandparents' maintenance obligation:** it is subsidiary and complementary; the most remote relative will be demanded only in case of the inability of the closest to provide maintenance (REsp 1.211.314).



Parents' right to maintenance obligation by sons and daughters – solidarity nature of the obligation when parents are old - based on The Statute of Elderly (Special law). (Resp 775.565)















Jurisprudence

- The Superior Court of Justice has decided:
- <u>Paternity Investigation lawsuit with child</u> <u>support</u> – it can be claimed at residence of child and once ulpheld is due from the quote (Precedents n. 1 and 277/STJ).
- <u>Spousal maintenance</u> it is exceptional and temporary. (REsp 933.355).

<u>Cancellation of maintenance obligation</u> – it is subject to a judicial decision, with the right to appeal (Precedent n. 358/STJ).















Jurisprudence



• The Supreme Federal Court has decided:

 Marriage equality (civil unions equality) - legal recognition of same-sex marriage, which include social security benefits, adoption of children, maintenance obligation.













Maintenance Recovery Proceedings

Recovery of Maintenance in the European Union and Worldwide Heidelberg Conference 5 – 8 March 2013

- Law nº 5.478 (25/July/1968) refers to proceeding for recovery of child support and others family maintenance.
- The judiciary system is organized into federal and state branches. Proceedings for maintenance recovery are taking before state Courts.
- Provisional measures for maintenance obligation may be established by judges until final decision.











Maintenance Recovery Proceedings

- The Brazilian procedure for litigation involves some proceeding stated by law. In general, there are four phases for ordinary procedures :
 - a pleading stage (fase postulatória),
 - a conclusive opening order (despacho saneador),
 - an evidentiary stage (fase probatória) and
 - a decision-making stage (sentença).













Recovery of Maintenance in the

European Union and Worldwide Heidelberg Conference 5 – 8 March 2013

Enforcement of the Decision

Recovery of Maintenance in the European Union and Worldwide Heidelberg Conference 5 – 8 March 2013

Enforcement by means of income withholding (article 734 of the Code of Civil Procedure)

- Enforcement under the penalty of pledge (article 735 of the Code of Civil Procedure)
- Enforcement under the penalty of civil arrest (article 733, paragraph 1 of the Code of Civil Procedure)













International Maintenance Obligation

Brazilian Perspective

- International legal cooperation has been the milestone for promoting cross-border judicial disputes. It's based upon
- Multilateral treaties
 - Convention on the Recovery Abroad of Maintenance
 - Inter-American Convention on Maintenance Obligation.
- Bilateral treaties
- Reciprocity principle













Recovery of Maintenance in the European Union and Worldwide

Heidelberg Conference 5 – 8 March 2013

Debtor lives abroad

- Service of documents abroad: letter rogatory (Treaties or Reciprocity)
- Taking of evidence abroad: letter rogatory (Treaties or Reciprocity)
- Recognition and enforcement of a court order/decision: MERCOSUR – letter rogatory (Treaties)
- Establishment of a decision in the requested State: The 1956 United Nations Convention on the Recovery of Maintenance from Abroad (Treaty)













Creditor lives abroad

- Service of documents abroad: letter rogatory (Treaties or Reciprocity)
- Taking of evidence abroad: letter rogatory (Treaties or Reciprocity)
- Recognition and enforcement of a court order/decision: Recognition Action before the Superior Court of Justice (STJ). MERCOSUL - letter rogatory (Treaties)
- Establishment of a decision in the requested State: The 1956 United Nations Convention on the Recovery of Maintenance from Abroad (Treaty)











Brazilian's Policy for Recovery of Maintenance

Recovery of Maintenance in the European Union and Worldwide Heidelberg Conference 5 – 8 March 2013

Studying Group for analysing both instruments, the Hague Convention and the Protocol – dialogue with academy

(Portaria SNJ n. 16/2009).



 Inter-Ministerial Working Group (Ministry of Justice (SNJ, CONJUR, SAL) and Ministry of External Relations (SBEG, CONJUR)
Portaria n. 500/2012 with participation of

representative of judicial power and civil society.

HCCH







Access to Justice for All

- Cross-border family's conflicts: free legal assistance, may or shall include all means of providing it and also be assured for vulnerable person?
- Local decisions with global effects: new roles for central authorities?
- International litispendence: Article 90 Code of Civil Procedure?
- Enforcement measures: states should provide enforcement of a decision which includes civil arrest?













Access to Justice for All

Recovery of Maintenance in the European Union and Worldwide Heidelberg Conference 5 – 8 March 2013

 Direct communication or request to competent authorities: *exequatur*, direct legal assistance and recognition of foreign decision procedures.



- Lower costs for transferring of small amounts or fee waivers for very low values: binding agreement among states?
- Costs of translation documents: high costs of translation, requirement must be translated to Portuguese.





Access to Justice for All

Recovery of Maintenance in the European Union and Worldwide Heidelberg Conference 5 – 8 March 2013

- The effectiveness of persons' rights in a globalized world depends on its international access to justice wherever they are or where they have to do so.
- International maintenance obligation is based on human rights principles (dignity of human being and family solidarity); therefore states boundaries cannot be used for undermining any right.















THANK YOU!

- INEZ LOPES MATOS C. DE FARIAS
 - Professor of International Law at University of Brasília (UnB)
 - Site: <u>http://www.fd.unb.br</u>
 - <u>inezlopes@unb.br</u>
 - (61) 3107-0710













